

UNVEILING COMPLEX GENDER DYNAMICS IN SELF-DETERMINATION MOVEMENTS: A SOUTH ASIAN PERSPECTIVE

Shipra Shukla,

PhD. Student, Department of Political Science, University of Delhi.

ABSTRACT

This scholarly paper critically analyzes the fundamental assertion of just causes within self-determination movements in conflict-ridden regions, with a specific focus on the intricate gender dynamics inherent in these narratives. Extensive historical and conflict-related studies form the backdrop for this inquiry, shedding light on the emergence and persistence of self-determination movements in South Asian conflict regions since the early 20th century. Through a nuanced exploration of the interplay between self-determination, gender, and historical narratives, this research underscores the multifaceted impacts of these movements on women within these conflict-laden territories.

INTRODUCTION

The emergence of self-determination movements within conflict-ridden territories of South Asia inherently pivots on the bedrock of a just cause. Nevertheless, the present study embarks on an exploration of the validity of such foundational assumptions and delves into the intricate and often overlooked gendered dimensions underlying these movements. Despite a substantial corpus of literature dissecting the historical and conflict discourses inherent to South Asian regions, gender considerations within the narratives of self-determination have regrettably received scant attention. This research endeavours to rectify this scholarly gap by providing an incisive examination of the complex interplay between self-determination, gender dynamics, and latent narratives.

The inception of self-determination movements across conflict-stricken regions in South Asia invariably rests on the premise of a just cause. However, the essence of this claim begs a deeper inquiry—does the movement genuinely uphold a just cause? The application of gender analysis to the same context unearths a far more intricate historical

narrative. Despite a wealth of studies dedicated to unravelling the historical and conflict-driven discourses of South Asian regions, the focus on the gender aspect remains inadequate. This shortcoming is acutely observable from local to international media platforms, including Bollywood, which, while attempting to illuminate the multifaceted issues of South Asian conflicts, systematically sidesteps the issue of women within the normative analysis of just causes in self-determination. This gendered oversight becomes particularly pronounced when examining recent literary narratives from the region, such as Wahid Mirza's "The Collaborator" and Siddhartha Gigoo's "The Garden of Solitude," authored by young Kashmiris.

Within this framework, it becomes paramount to recognize that women's experiences and roles hold profound significance. The outbreak of armed conflict in regions like Sri Lanka and Kashmir has induced a surge of young men joining militant groups to champion self-determination. However, in this process, the accompanying adversities and tribulations borne by the most vulnerable faction of society, namely women, have been disproportionately disregarded. While the

pursuit of the right to secede propels these groups, and even their leaders, the experiences and sufferings endured by women, who did not actively elect the circumstances thrust upon them, are often relegated to the background. Although individuals have fought and sacrificed their lives under the banner of nationalism and self-determination, the predicament of those inadvertently left behind—a life they never chose—is left largely unattended. Even in instances where parent states ostensibly prioritize plebiscites, motivations frequently surpass the preservation of lives and property. Instead, the actions are justified by the need to safeguard regions of cultural, economic, and military significance within the broader state framework. This strategic approach reinforces the disregard for the human toll exacted by these marginalized regions, particularly the plight of women, as they grapple with the repercussions of conflict-driven self-determination.

DEFICIENCY IN GENDER-CENTRIC DISCOURSE WITHIN THE REALM OF SELF-DETERMINATION

Beneath the veiled façade of purportedly just causes that often shroud self-determination movements, lie intricate gendered implications that warrant thorough exploration. Within regions marked by territorial disputes involving nations such as India, Bangladesh, Afghanistan, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, and China, generations of women and girls have come of age amidst the enduring shadows of conflict, trauma, and violence. Regrettably, their experiences frequently remain relegated to the fringes of mainstream discourse. The escalating instances of enforced disappearances, underscored by estimations ranging from 8,000 to 10,000 missing individuals, as reported by the Association of Disappeared Persons, cast a sombre pall over these landscapes marred by conflict. Furthermore, the emergence of self-determination movements within conflict-ridden territories of South Asia inherently pivots on the bedrock of a just cause. Nevertheless, the present study embarks on an exploration of the validity of such foundational assumptions and delves

into the intricate and often overlooked gendered dimensions underlying these movements. Despite a substantial corpus of literature dissecting the historical and conflict discourses inherent to South Asian regions, gender considerations within the narratives of self-determination have regrettably received scant attention. This research endeavors to rectify this scholarly gap by providing an incisive examination of the complex interplay between self-determination, gender dynamics, and latent narratives.

UNVEILING GENDERED REALITIES WITHIN SELF-DETERMINATION PARADIGMS

The inception of self-determination movements across conflict-stricken regions in South Asia invariably rests on the premise of a just cause. However, the essence of this claim begs a deeper inquiry—does the movement genuinely uphold a just cause? The application of gender analysis to the same context unearths a far more intricate historical narrative. Despite a wealth of studies dedicated to unraveling the historical and conflict-driven discourses of South Asian regions, the focus on the gender aspect remains inadequate. This shortcoming is acutely observable from local to international media platforms, including Bollywood, which, while attempting to illuminate the multifaceted issues of South Asian conflicts, systematically sidesteps the issue of women within the normative analysis of just causes in self-determination. This gendered oversight becomes particularly pronounced when examining recent literary narratives from the region, such as Wahid Mirza's "The Collaborator" and Siddhartha Gigoo's "The Garden of Solitude," authored by young Kashmiris.

Within this framework, it becomes paramount to recognize that women's experiences and roles hold profound significance. The outbreak of armed conflict in regions like Sri Lanka and Kashmir has induced a surge of young men joining militant groups to champion self-determination.

However, in this process, the accompanying adversities and tribulations borne by the most vulnerable faction of society, namely women, have been disproportionately disregarded. While the pursuit of the right to secede propels these groups, and even their leaders, the experiences and sufferings endured by women, who did not actively elect the circumstances thrust upon them, are often relegated to the background. Although individuals have fought and sacrificed their lives under the banner of nationalism and self-determination, the predicament of those inadvertently left behind—a life they never chose—is left largely unattended.

Even in instances where parent states ostensibly prioritize plebiscites, motivations frequently surpass the preservation of lives and property. Instead, the actions are justified by the need to safeguard regions of cultural, economic, and military significance within the broader state framework. This strategic approach reinforces the disregard for the human toll exacted by these marginalized regions, particularly the plight of women, as they grapple with the repercussions of conflict-driven self-determination. The plight of women as victims, interwoven with the challenges faced by children born within these contexts, compounds the prevailing humanitarian crisis.

THE COMPLEX IDENTITY OF CONFLICT-AFFECTED WOMEN

This study sheds light on the intricate identity crises faced by women enmeshed within the self-determination paradigm—a facet often relegated to obscurity. The pursuit of recognition, interwoven with socio-cultural and religious contexts, gives rise to a complex interplay between gender equality, widowhood, remarriage, and marital status. Simultaneously, the psychological toll exacted on these women, manifesting as depression, emotional instability, and post-traumatic stress disorder, amplifies their vulnerability. A delicate equilibrium between allegiance to absent husbands and the demands of economic survival shapes their arduous journey.

Trapped within the convoluted web of territorial conflicts involving India, Bangladesh, Afghanistan, Pakistan, Sri Lanka, and China, the women and young girls of conflict regions have matured prematurely in the face of trauma, violence, and the omnipresent threat of conflict. In the pursuit of equality, many women and girls find themselves marginalized, devoid of a voice. Scores of hapless women are ensnared within the constrictions of South Asian laws and societal norms. The phenomenon of enforced disappearances in conflict-ridden South Asian regions has engendered an atmosphere of fear that erodes the well-being of families grappling with the aftermath. While official estimates put the count of missing persons at around 4,000, the Association of Disappeared Persons (APDP) contends that the actual figure lies between 8,000 and 10,000 within the region. The actual numbers of both half-orphans and women are believed to be substantially higher. Throughout the years of conflict in South Asia, it is evident that women, much like men, have silently borne the brunt of suffering. These women grapple not only with the challenges of preserving their own identities, but also with the weight of their children's self-esteem, entwined with the absence of a father figure. Consequently, an entire generation of children navigates the quagmire of shattered dreams and identity crises. Rather than delving into the nuanced narratives of these women, prevailing discourse predominantly attempts to quantify the number of half-widows. This study endeavors to rectify this oversight by presenting comprehensive insights into the experiences of these women that go beyond mere quantification.

In the realm of legal discourse, scholars have yet to reach a consensus regarding the specific legal requirements and rights of women. Thousands of women are presently trapped within a state of limbo, grappling with an identity crisis stemming from the ambiguity of their marital status—whether they are married or widowed. This struggle underscores a cultural fissure within conflict regions, wherein the needs of women and the broader issue of gender equality remain obscured. Caught within

the crossfire of socio-cultural and religious discourses, widows and survivors of sexual violence in conflict regions face the challenge of carving out a space for themselves and voicing their concerns, a challenge that warrants in-depth understanding.

A large number of impoverished women in South Asia, lacking the privilege of wealth, are enduring desolate conditions and grappling with psychological afflictions precipitated by the scars of war, often culminating in tendencies towards suicide. Many women find themselves grappling with psychological challenges including depression, phobias, emotional instability, and post-traumatic stress disorder. The decision of whether to remarry, or not, presents a relentless dilemma, characterized by a delicate balance between loyalty to a missing husband and the prospect of forging a new life. This decision carries profound implications for the well-being and survival of their children—a Herculean task for single mothers contending with the complexities of life, education, and livelihood. It is important to note that instances abound where women eschew living with their in-laws due to their relegated status as domestic aides rather than full-fledged family members. In the face of harsh and demanding circumstances, opportunities for women are scant and distant. Thus, an imperative exists to comprehensively understand the predicament faced by women, within the parameters of the established framework and theoretical background of this study.

EXAMINING SELF-DETERMINATION THROUGH A GENDERED LENS

The present theoretical study delves into the plight of women within conflict zones, with a specific focus on South Asian regions such as Bangladesh, Kashmir, Manipur, Nagaland, and Sri Lanka. By examining the intersection of the Self-Determination movement and the notion of Just Cause, the study seeks to illuminate the predicament of women in these conflict-ridden areas. This inquiry is conducted with sensitivity to the prevailing circumstances of the study area, presenting purposive and diverse

empirical examples that span various demographic, social, and economic groups of women.

SIGNIFICANCE AND FINDINGS OF THIS THEORETICAL WORK

The main significance and findings of this study are as follows:

- To assess the disproportionate impact of conflict and destruction on women as compared to men.
- To acknowledge the silent suffering of women, recognizing that quantifying the tragedy they face, whether the suggested numbers are 2000 or 20,000, does not fully justify solutions. Nonetheless, the escalating numbers serve as an alarm for serious repercussions.
- To explore women's perspectives on self-determination.
- To draw the attention of the state towards women and their issues, emphasizing their significance in policy-making targeted at conflict zones. This importance is comparable to that of national security and the geo-strategic location of the South Asian region.
- To underscore the significance of the rights of these women and advocate for state intervention in cases of societal alienation.
- To examine how self-determination, while often perceived as a just cause, can further entrap women between feminist ideals and patriarchal structures.

This research seeks to amplify the muted sufferings of women ensnared within the tumultuous realm of South Asian self-determination movements. Objectives encompass comprehending the disproportionate impact of conflict on women, unravelling their perceptions of self-determination, and advocating for state intervention to safeguard women's rights amid conflict. This study posits

probing questions concerning the legitimacy of self-determination as a just cause, particularly regarding its ramifications for women's lives.

CONCLUSION

In summation, this paper endeavors to unveil the concealed narratives of women entrenched in the maelstrom of South Asian self-determination movements. While these movements ostensibly champion noble causes, the gendered dimensions unearthed herein cast a revealing light on the paradox where women emerge as marginalized victims of ostensibly virtuous endeavors. A comprehensive understanding of women's agency within nationalist movements is imperative to construct a more inclusive, equitable, and just approach to self-determination.

The research underscores the urgency of transcending conventional conflict analysis to illuminate the gendered dimensions frequently overshadowed within the overarching narrative. The imperative to grasp the agency of women within any nationalist struggle is rooted in the conceptual framework of the nation, wherein women assume the role of symbolic representations thereof. They become emblematic of national identity, simultaneously embodying the markers of territorial demarcation that are either safeguarded or violated in the course of nationalist endeavors.

Women's intricate involvement in the spheres of conflict and peace is entangled with a complex interplay of sentiments and emotions encompassing notions of nationhood, security, liberty, rights, agency, violence, and tranquility. Contrarily, the efficacy of the Self-Determination movement in empowering women is questionable, especially considering those who have actively participated in endeavors aimed at fortifying the movement. Paradoxically, women emerge as more pronounced victims within the context of self-determination conflicts. This dissonance poses a profound challenge to the very fabric of these movements, exposing the underlying intricacies and potential drawbacks therein.

REFERENCES

- Bashir, A. (2010, October 11). *Kashmiri Half-widows shoulder the burden of double tragedy*. Retrieved March 5, 2011, from www.guardian.co.uk: www.guardian.co.uk/global-development/2010/oct/11/1
- Behera, N. C. (2006). *Demystifying Kashmir*. Washington, D.C.: Brookings Institution Press.
- Beran, H. (1987). *The Consent Theory of political Obligation*. London and Croom Helm.
- Buchanan, A. (1991). *Secession: The Morality of Political Divorce: From Fort Sumter to Lithuania and Quebec*. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press, 1991.
- Chandhoke, N. (2005). *Of Broken Social Contract and Ethnic Violence: The Case of Kashmir. Working Paper No.75*. Delhi, Delhi, India.
- Chandhoke, N. (2012). *Contested Secessions: Rights, Self-determination, Democracy in Kashmir*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Chenoy, A. (2004). *Women in the South Asian Conflict Zones. South Asian Survey*, 35-47.
- De-Shalit, A. (1996). *National Self-Determination; Political, Not Cultural. Political Studies*, 44(5), 906-920. doi:10.1111/j.1467-9248.1996.tb00341.x
- Desk, D. H. (2022). *'We're innocent, Hindus don't do that,' says Bilkis Bano rape case convict*. New Delhi: Deccan Herald. Retrieved from <https://www.deccanherald.com/national/west/were-innocent-hindus-don-t-do-that-says-bilkis-bano-rape-case-convict-1156071.html>

- Desk, T. H. (2017). *Who are Chakmas*. New Delhi: The Hindu. Retrieved January 1, 2023, from <https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/who-are-chakmas/article61473775.ece>
- Dewan, R. (1994, October 8). 'Hamsheera' 'Hamsaya': Sisters, Neighbours: Women's Testimonies from Kashmir. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 29(41), 2654-2658.
- Enloe, C. (1989). *Banana Beaches and Bases: Making Feminist Sense of International Politics*. London, England: University of California Press Ltd.
- Feinberg, J. (1984). *The Moral Limits to the Criminal Law*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Gigoo, S. (2011). *The Garden of Solitude*. New Delhi: Rupa Publications India Pvt.Ltd.
- Hossain, A. (2016, March). *Why Is The Mass Sexualized Violence Of Bangladesh's Liberation War Being Ignored?* Retrieved January 22, 2023, from www.anushayhossain.com: <https://anushayhossain.com/2016/03/25/bangladeshs-birangonas-world-must-acknowledge-1971-rape-survivors/>
- Huda, T. (2016, December 21). *Birangonas: The liberators left unliberated*. Retrieved from The Daily Star: <https://www.thedailystar.net/opinion/society/birangonas-the-liberators-left-unliberated-1332943>
- Hussain, A. (2007, December 4). *The Plight of Kashmir's Half-widows*. Retrieved March 5, 2011, from www.news.bbc.co.uk: http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/south_asia
- Karmakar, R. (2018). *Ground Zero Being Bru in Mizoram*. New Delhi: The Hindu. Retrieved May 19, 2021, from <https://www.thehindu.com/news/national/ground-zero-being-bru-in-mizoram/article25746175.ece>
- Khan, F. A. (2006). Speaking Violence: Pakistani Women's Narratives of Pakistan. In N. C. Behera (Ed.), *Gender, Conflict and Migration* (Vol. 03, pp. 97-115). New Delhi: Sage Publications.
- Manchanda, R. (2003, April 12-18). Feminist Narratives of Conflict and Nation-State. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 38(15), 1467-1472.
- Mill, J. S. (1954). *Utilitarianism, Liberty and Representative Government*. Great Britain: London J.M.Dent& Sons Ltd., New York E.P.Dutton & Co. Inc.
- Moore, M. (1998). The Territorial Dimension of Self-Determination. In M. Moore (Ed.), *National Self-Determination and Secession* (pp. 134-157). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Nielsen, K. (1993, April). Secession: The Case of Quebec. *Journal of Applied Philosophy*, 10(1), 29-43. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-5930.1993.tb00060.x>
- Philpott, D. (1995, January). In Defense of Self-Determination. *Ethics*, 105(2), 352-385.
- Philpott, D. (1998). Self-Determination in Practice. In M. Moore (Ed.), *National Self-Determination and Secession* (pp. 79-102). New York: Oxford University Press.
- Pomerance, M. (1982). *Self Determination in Law and Practice*. Brill Nijhoff.
- Raz, A. M. (1990). National Self Determination. *Journal of Philosophy*, 86(9), 445-47.
- Tagore, R. (2011). *The Home and the World*. (D. S. Dilip Kumar Basu, Ed., & S. Tagore, Trans.) Delhi, Delhi, India: Worldview Publishers.
- Vickers, J. (2006, 08 16). 'Bringing Nations In: Some Methodological and Conceptual Issues in Connecting Feminism with

Nationhood and Nationalism'. *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 8(1), 84-109.
doi:10.1080/14616740500415490

- Waheed, M. (2011). *The Collaborator*. England: Penguin Group.
- Wellman, C. (Spring 1995). A Defense of Secession and Political Self Determination. *Philosophy and Public Affairs*, 24(02).
- Zalewski, M., & Enloe, C. (1995). Questions of Identity. In K. Booth, & S. Smith (Eds.), *International Relations Theory Today*. Cambridge: Polity Press.